

Haitians' Perception of Foreign Non-Governmental Organizations (FNGOS): The FNGO effect on Communal and Political Participation among Women and Men

Presented

by

Linda A. Lockett
Department of Political Science
University of Nevada Las Vegas
Las Vegas, NV 89154
lockettl@unlv.nevada.edu

Prepared for delivery at the annual meeting of the Western Political Science Association, April 2-4, Las Vegas, NV.

Thanks to Dr. Jonathan Strand, Dr. Michelle Kuenzi, and Dr. Ted Jelen for comments on an early version of this paper.

Abstract

Recently Haiti has been referred to as the “Republic of NGOs” by some. Before the 2010 Haitian earthquake there were 3,000 Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs). Since after the earthquake there are approximately 10,000 NGOs in Haiti. NGOs have taken over many of the important roles of providing services, delivery and rebuilding of the country that should have input provided by the government. Goals of NGOs do not match the capacity and needs of the Haitian government. NGOs funding undermine the Haitian government’s ability to develop human and institutional capacity to deliver services. There are different goals among NGOs concerning equality of women rights (violence, crime), education reproductive health (especially by religious NGOs). NGOs may also influence Haitian women’s communal and political participation. Using the LAPOP 2012 Americas Barometer Survey, this study examines the effects of the evaluation of foreign NGOs on different forms of public participation for men and women in Haiti.

Before the 2010 earthquake Haiti has received much support from a variety of multilateral funding sources for its needs, support and services. The service provisions that the country receives in income is mostly from outsiders, and the funding had been much larger than its GDP. Haiti's economy suffered a severe setback in January 2010 when a 7.0 magnitude earthquake destroyed much of its capital city, Port-au-Prince, and neighboring areas. Estimates are that over 300,000 people were killed and some 1.5 million left homeless. The earthquake was assessed as the worst in this region over the last 200 years (CIA, 2014). Since the earthquake there has been a rise in the number of Non Governmental Organizations (NGOs) operating in Haiti, reaching a total of approximately 10,000.

In this paper I will investigate causes and consequences of evaluation of foreign NGOS among Haitian men and women. Why do some Haitians evaluate foreign NGOs more positively than others? Do positive attitudes toward foreign NGOs enhance or inhibit Haitian political participation? Are there important gender differences?

This current study confirms Schuller's (2012a) hybrid theory of (and the importance of) civic participation (Putnam, 1995, 2000; Mansbridge, 1999) in the Haitian civil society. He asserts that "genetically modified" collective organizations continue to exist in Haiti, is proof that Haiti's civil society has adapted to the managerial regimes of NGOs to re-evaluate aid policy. In other words, there is social capital in Haiti even after the earthquake (Schuller 2012a, 50).

NGOs are defined as non-state actors in global governance that are a broad category of diverse organizations, including groups similar to domestic interest groups. NGOS have

transnational concerns and organizational structures, and are groups that do not focus on influencing governments, but which are involved with conducting diverse activities in different countries. For example, NGO activities would include an organization such as International Planned Parenthood Federation a healthcare provider; a humanitarian organization such as the Red Cross; Greenpeace; the International Renaissance Foundation, an organization that advocates democracy; and many church and religious organizations of diverse denominations.

The World Bank's Operational Directive 14.70 defines NGOs as "private organizations that pursue activities to relieve suffering, promote the interests of the poor, protect the environment, provide basic social services, or undertake community development (World Bank 2014a; World Bank 2014b)." The United Nations (UN) definition purports the role of NGOs (in its Consultative Status has its foundation in Article 71 of Chapter 10 of the United Nations Charter) as advocates to promote the interest of the poor.

In that spirit, this current study confirms that the role of international organizations and NGOs can best promote the interest of the poor through the survey of client perception. Before the proliferation of NGOs, and for over fifty years most of the client/recipient international organization and government institutional study has been on internally displaced persons (IDPs) stemming from war, conflict or disaster which deals with processes of how goods and services reach clients or recipients (Proudfoot, 1957; Harrell-Bond, 1982; Reynell 1986; Parpart, 1986, Black, 2001) . There have been more studies of local and international NGOs perception of their performance, their effectiveness, and evaluation and perception of each other (Narnwira, 2002; O'Connor, 2014; Alnoor, 2003; Riley, 2002). There are fewer studies generated by government and non-governmental institutions which asks recipients how they feel about or how they perceive a governmental or a non-governmental program. This approach has been recently

introduced by advocates as an important accountability exercise for NGOs. Feedback of perception measures, self-identifiable questions and feelings surveys of the clients/respondents are some of the best methods in which to make sure that needs of the clients are met. Client perceptions studies show a standard of accountability to beneficiaries, it adds credibility and attracts potential donor-ship (Jakobsen 2011; van Praag, 2011; Siyoum, Hilhorst and Gerrit-Jan Van Uffelen, 2012; Ong, 2015; Refstie, 2012).

Women, Power and NGOs

While international organizations have explicit purpose to help the poor, the environment, and the suffering, women empowerment has been the latest trend globally. Major strands of feminist theory in international relations are supportive in the main ideas of feminism (whether from the thoughts of empiricism, standpoint theory or postmodernism). Liberation of women is its main process. Economic and social equality for women globally. Those ideas espouse that international relations must make inclusive the discussion of policy and gender from the feminist perspective. The feminist approaches have been successful in attaining international policy for women concerning development and democratization. These approaches are being adopted into the goals of NGOs to bring equality to women worldwide.

Haiti has a very patriarchal culture in which men's and women's roles are well defined. Women are internal caregivers and men are external breadwinners. Men are more likely to participate in the public sphere of society while women are expected to be contained in the private sphere (Maternowska 2006). Feminist theory in international relations would encourage NGOs to facilitate communications about participation across genders or gender lines. Hence, the implications for this current study one would expect feminist theory in international relations

to view that NGOs have a goal to increase the communal and political participation by women in Haiti's patriarchal society.

The pressure of advocacy by Feminist organizations to address the void of gender equality in the global world, including their campaigning to international institutions; and after the fall of World Bank (WB) president James Wolfowitz in 2007¹, and the Strategic Compact reform², has led to some formation of institutional programs and studies about women in the global society. As result, the UN created several women's organization and projects, and applied aid which has been implemented by the United Nations programs, International Monetary Fund and World Bank for funding of women programs.

The United Nations has a women's equity program titled the United Nations Entity for Gender Equality and the Empowerment of Women (UN Women). Since 1976 UNIFEM provides financial and technical assistance to innovative programs and strategies that promote women's human rights, political participation and economic security. The UN has also been focusing on implementations of the Millennium Development Goals (MDG) for women and girls, it has eight various main goals for women. One of the most important goals is on Promoting Gender Equality and Empowering Women. (UN 2014b).

There has been an evolution of gender and development (GAD) in the World Bank's policy norm; it has tried to promote gender issues within all area of the Banks operation starting with policy papers such as Enhancing Womens' Participation in Economic Development 4.2 1994. In 1997 the Strategic Compact reorganization gave the GAD group opportunity to network with the

¹ Wolfowitz resigned as president of the World Bank Group after the World Bank committee investigated alleged ethics violations surrounding altering proposals and conflict of interest issues by Wolfowitz..

² The Strategic Compact was launched April of 2007. It was a compact was a compact "between the Bank and its shareholders: to invest \$250 million in additional resources over a three-year period to deliver a fundamentally transformed institution, and to reduce poverty (World Bank, 2014c; 2014d).

Poverty Reduction and Economic Management (PREM) unit. In 2006 the WB created an action plan for the *Gender Equality of Smart Economics* the program allow a specific focus on mainstreaming gender in the economic sector the World Bank's best tools for lending and technical assistance. This comprehensive program allowed women to be successful across all institutions that effect labor, rights, market participants, wages, transportation, credit and productivity (Park and Vetterlein, 2010). The International Monetary Fund (IMF) supports the World Bank's 2012 *World Development Report: Gender Equality and Development* plan of action. The IMF asserts that "closing gender gaps benefits countries as a whole, not just women and girls (IMF, 2014)."

Some of these NGO-led/ managed women's organizations have been placed in Haiti (Haiti Libre, 2014a; Haiti Libre, 2014b; Haiti Libre, 2014c). What does the creation and implementation of these programs mean for the implication of this current study? This study seeks to examine whether NGOS can either empower or inhibit women's active citizenship.

The Rise of NGOs in Haiti

Gradually, and more so after the 2010 earthquake in Haiti, there has been a rise in not only NGO-led women's organizations but in the total number of NGO. Not all NGOs are equal. Some NGOs lack resources and accountability, as NGO donor goals do not meet the needs of the recipients, some NGOs do not allow or are limited in their capacity to allow for recipient participation. Some NGOs directors and staff have low levels of autonomy as they must follow the goals of the states or donors. Some NGOs are short-termed (they may only exist up to three to four years) and do not last long enough to be successful; such as short-term textile factory jobs (Schuller, 2012b; Maternowska, 2006; Fatton, 2014).

Because of the rise of NGOs in Haiti, their greater capacity, and their higher levels of funding. The Haitian government and its people look to NGOs for service instead of to its own government. As an example, the USAID provided three hundred million dollars in Haiti in the financial year 2007-2008. The projects that were within this budget amount was much more the Haitian Ministry of Planning's (MPCE) budget (MPCE is responsible for international relations in Haiti and is part of the Prime Minister's Cabinet). The consequences of the rise in NGOs in Haiti have caused problematic shifts in the government's responsibility for providing basic essential services. The public sector's low capacity and accountability has decreased since before the invasion of NGOs, and corruption has increased. The funneling of aid has lessened the actors and institutions in the country's ability to create development (Kristoff and Panarelli 2014).

Some observers of NGOs and women in Haiti (Schuller, 2012b; Fatton, 2014; Maternowska, 2006) argue that the rise of NGOs are part of a neoliberal, imperialist paradigm that has been built on a history of marginalizing and reproduction of inequities (Maternowska (2006, 109). Maternowska (2006) asserts that in the 1990s, after Aristide was ousted, and the military junta took over, the United States placed an economic embargo on Haiti, which was the worse harm done to Haiti. In 1991 President George Bush exempted U.S. factories on the peninsula/island in order protect Haiti's business elite and U.S. capital in Haiti (Maternowska 2006, 8-9). Maternowska contends than colonialism, occupation and development has keep on going social and economic inequities, especially through US imperialism. Maternowska (2006); Schuller (2012b); Fatton (2014) agree that pushing rural residents and farmers off their land hurt the Haitian economy by forcing farmers to receive U.S. subsidized rice and forcing Haiti to lower tariffs. This forced migration pushed people to live in the urban slums, to seek job in factories in the cities for low wages. All of these

elements caused a collapse of the economy and the society at large. This also caused a sudden rise in NGOs coming into the country to take the place of the failing government ability to sustain itself. Not only was Haiti politically repressed but economically repressed as well. It became a state absent of democracy and equity. Fatton (2014) declares that globalization is only a new word for modern day imperialism. He contends that many so call defined 'failed states' countries in the South (Sierra Leone, Guinea, Democratic Republic of Congo, Somalia, East Timor, Afghanistan and Haiti) are what he called states of the 'outer periphery' (Fatton 2014, 2) based on the Wallerstein's (1979; 2004; 2006) World Periphery theory. The implications for the observers view in this current study would strengthen the argument that NGOs increase dependency and inhibit self-governance.

Three Studies of NGOs in Haiti urge NGOS to engage in more NGO recipient participation. Schuller (2012a), Schuller (2012b) Fatton (2014) and Maternowska (2006) have also written about the lack of NGO transparency, and the misuse of projects, coordination, legitimacy and accountability within some NGOs. Some literature has focused specifically on ~~the~~ women and their participation with NGOs. Moreover, Schuller (2012b) and Maternowska (2006) have written about the participation and autonomy within some NGOs that provided service to women.

Schuller (2012b) argues that NGOs in Haiti may have different strategies for participation of women in NGOS. The author's study compares two NGOs and the relationship they have with their aid recipients and the communities; and the communities' relationships with the two NGOs. The two NGO-led women's organization are Sove Lavi and Fanm Tet Ansanm. He found a difference in the level of recipient involvement. As the strategy of one NGO, Fanm Tet Ansanm, a public health and HIV/AIDS education, family planning organization

has a high level of involvement. (The organization begin with empowering women factory worker through education courses during the post–Duvalier 1985 US Caribbean Basin Initiatives (CBI) program.)³ Gender equality and literacy courses were added later, and the Women’s (Vigilante) Committee begin. Fanm Tet Ansanm’s strategy encouraged recipient participation in execution, discussion, planning, program design and priority setting. The other NGO, Sove Lavi, begin as a program in the late 1980s within a branch of the UN. Sove Lavi assembled community leaders from the peasant pool to disseminate public health information. It targeted women in development projects. Later the program added HIV/AIDS prevention centers and education projects. Sove Lavi has “when it occurred at all, was primarily limited to the minute implementation details (Schuller 2012b, 12).” that reduced women to participate on a lower level.

Schuller (2012a) examined different conceptual views of ‘participation’ by women who were NGO recipients in internally displaced persons camps (IDPs), by NGOS staff and donors after the 2010 earthquake. This study points out that the idea of participation by the recipients may be different from an NGO staff or donors. For example, in surveys gathered, Haitians may self describe ‘participation’ as to “carry a lot of heavy rocks on our heads” (Schuller 2102a, 65; Schuller 2012b, 69.).

Schuller (2012a) reveals that social capital networking has been alive in Haiti for many year before neoliberalism took over the farms and brought in apparel factories, and even when rural people move to the urban slum areas to receive NGO services from the internally displaced persons (IDP) camps after the 2010 earthquake. This is consistent with Putnam’s

³ The Caribbean Basin Initiatives (CBI) was a temporary trade program that was initiated by the US Congressional law, the Caribbean Basin Economic Recovery Act (CBERA) in 1983. The program seek to benefit countries in the Caribbean and Central America with control of tariffs and generating trade (GPO, 2014).

(2000) theory of emerging social capital and civic participation. More importantly, Schuller asserts that Haiti has always had a civil society that has continued to exist even after the earthquake and it “remains a vital force in the country (Schuller 2012a, 50).” People know who their neighbors are. The study argues that today’s Haitian civil society have “adapted” into a new form as “genetically modified organizations.” This term refers to a hybrid organization of internally displaced persons (IDPs) ‘participating’ in camps with the creation of resident committees within those camps that are part of the managerial regimes of nongovernmental organizations (NGOs). This is a sign of empowering Haitians. Although NGOs have slowly begin to interact with the urban civil society institutions in Haiti, Schuller cautions that grassroots participation and the communication agenda of NGOs should incorporate all of the old methods of working together and helping each other (*youn ede lòt*) and communal contribution⁴ type culture which has existed for many centuries in Haiti. Otherwise, NGOs will reproduce a top-down relationship which may hold communities in a dependent hands-out mode instead of rebuilding through self-sufficient efforts (Schuller 2012a, 69).

Robert Fatton (2014) echoes Schuller (2012a; 2012b) in that NGOs have been undermined by the neoliberal West, and the international funding marginalized an already weak state and replaces it with “omnipresent” foreign NGOs. He calls Haiti a ‘Republic of NGOs’ (Fatton 2014, 99). Fatton (2014, 106) states that non-Haitians own approximately 99 percent of disbursement of the post earthquake relief aid. Haitian NGOs except for two were excluded from the Haitian relief or recovery funds. Most NGOs lack transparency and

⁴ Haitian *youn ede lòt* is the country’s traditional philosophy of valuing the idea of helping each other. *Konbit* is about the method of working together; for example, one must till friends’ fields as well as your own. The belief of *kotizasyon* is highly regarded, in that everyone must chip in, contribute, gather a donation, and cooperate (Schuller 2012a, 69).

accountability. He agrees and quotes Schuller's suggestion that the NGOs in Haiti would be more successful if they included community participation in their goals (Fatton 2014, 109):

“If a particular NGO empowers local recipient communities to participate in all aspects of their work from setting priorities to evaluation, is autonomous from not only the state but also donor agencies, then communities can use this NGOs to solve local problems. Conversely, if an NGO lacks local participation and autonomy, international donors can use it to establish foreign priorities and maintain control over the country. (Schuller (2012b, 9)

The Maternowska (2006) *Reproducing Inequities* book is an ethnographic study using interviews and observations concerning recipient women and NGOs. The beginning of the book is about a poorly run US family planning program and the focus of how the program failed to get participants to attend the clinic and how it fails to create participation outlets and interaction with the beneficiaries. The author examines four NGOs' family planning programs and the strategies that include women's participation for success. The study tries to understand how a family planning program led by an international organization (The Centre de Developpement de la Sante (CDS), and a nongovernmental organization (NGO) funded by the United States Agency for International Development (USAID) failed to induce women (and men) to use contraception and the protection against HIV /AIDS program. She found that the CDS program had poor service, and poor consultations and explanations from doctors and staff about the benefits of these services. The program may have failed at its worst from 1980s to 1990s during a time of unstable changes of regimes. During this time Haitians felt that the clinics were set up by some type of political plan by right-wing neoliberals, 'the outsiders;' which was using the family planning CDS program as an "enslavement (Maternowska, 2006, 2)" to control their sexuality and maternity decisions. (Before the author became an insider, Haitians thought that the author was a journalist or

working with the Central Intelligence Agency (CIA) because she kept field notes (Maternowska, 2006, 13).

The author studied four successful NGO-led family planning and health programs that provided not only contraception services but added integrated healthcare. Most importantly they used community participation strategies to promote the programs and services such as: organizing promoters to do house calls, community-based distribution of birth control methods, and use of mobile teams. This proves that by allowing communities to participate can improve the civic participation in Haiti's civil society. The coordinated participation and goals lead to the empowerment of women's communities.

NGOs can effectively lead urban and rural recipients and internally displaced persons (IDPs) to sustainable lives and development by combining surveys that ask various questions about clients perceptions of NGOs and how they view aid. NGOs can use of community-based programs that incorporate the deep-rooted Haitian cultural ideas and values within its civil society of working together and helping each other (*youn ede lòt*).

NGO Reform for Participation and Autonomy

As an example to reformation of NGOs' participation and autonomy problems is addressed by Schuller (2012a). Schuller recommends policy solution for USAID that can be applied to other development institutions, donors and NGOs to implement real participation and autonomy. Most importantly, he suggests to the staff of these institutions that these policy considerations should be made, and the changes should be made to "understand the critical importance of genuine participation within development efforts" instead of using aid as a tool in a geopolitical game (Schuller 2012a, 193).

In this study, I attempt a more systematic assessment of the effects of foreign NGOs (or, more specifically, public perceptions of the performance of NGOs) on the empowerment of ordinary Haitians, and, in particular, on the empowerment of Haitian women. The previous studies cited above have been based on case studies of specific organizations. In this study, I will expand this research by conducting a large-scale analysis, based on survey data. I address the following question: *Does the perception of NGOs by Haitians inhibit communal and political participation?*

The Purpose of the Study

There is literature on NGOs and Haitian women concerning labor/training/education, abortion/healthcare, and violence, but *there is* not much literature on the effects of NGOs on communal and electoral participation in Haiti. There is little literature on the perception/feelings of service providers/or NGOs by Haitian, especially by Haitian women concerning Foreign NGOS and the NGOs in the local community.

In this paper, I examine the causes and effects of attitudes toward foreign NGOs among Haitians. The main hypothesis is that Haitians whose evaluation of foreign NGOs is positive will engage in higher levels of participation in public affairs than those whose evaluations are more negative.

The analysis is based on subjective evaluations of foreign NGOs, rather than on their actual performance. The analysis does not measure performance directly, but rather it reveals citizens' responses to perceived performance of NGOs. This is valuable because it assesses the effect on foreign NGOs as experienced by ordinary Haitians.

Data and Methods

Data for this study were taken from the Latin American Public Opinion Study LAPOP 2012 for 1752 Haitians (876 women and 876 men). The most important variable in this study is the respondent's relative evaluation of the performance of foreign non-governmental organizations (NGOS). Respondents were asked to place themselves on the performance of six service provider in Haiti. For each, a score of 1 represents a belief that the service is "very good," and 5 indicates a stance in which the service is "very bad" for all six providers:

National Government: How would you evaluate its performance?

Foreign Governments: How would you evaluate their performance?

Local NGOs: How would you evaluate their performance?

Local Churches: How would you evaluate their performance?

Neighborhood or Community Organizations: How would you evaluate their performance?

Foreign NGOS: How would you evaluate their performance?

Table 1 About Here

A factor analysis of these items indicated that evaluations of all six institutions load on a common factor. Factor analysis permits us to determine whether Haitians make distinctions among the performance of different public institutions. In general, the answer is that they do not. The analysis of these items reveals a one-factor solution, in which five of the six items loading was about equal except for the "national government" item, which loaded slightly lower than the other five items at .578. (The factor loadings associated with the other items hovered around .700). The Cronbach's alpha show a reliability at .797. In sum, there is a single attitude toward the institutional performance factor.

A mean was computed for the six variables, and the “Foreign NGOs” evaluation was subtracted from the overall mean. This difference represents the respondent’s evaluation of the performance of foreign NGOs, relative to other institutions. The relative value is computed to account for the possibility that respondents may be subject to response sets, such as positivity or negativity bias (Wilcox, Sigelman and Cook 1989). Again, this is a subjective evaluation of foreign NGOS, relative to other institutions.

Table 2 About Here

One dependent variable for this study was the respondent’s participation in communal affairs. This study factor analyzed several variables measuring frequency of attendance at meetings of a variety of non-governmental institutions.. A factor analysis of these items reveals a two-factor solution: One factor measures participation in religious organizations, and the other represents participation in secular institutions. All variables loaded on the first (secular) factor except “Meetings of any religious organization?”

I computed a variable of participation which equals the mean of all the variables that loaded more strongly on the first factor. The Cronbach’s alpha shows a reliability at .554. Since religious organizations load most heavily on a separate factor, the item measuring participation in religious organizations is not included in the calculation of the civic participation index.

The other dependent variables in the study are vote registration, and voting. The analysis was generated to seek to explain whether attitudes of NGOs have an effect on respondents to be registered to vote or whether respondents voted in elections. Control variables such as education, religion and church attendance were used to test effects of attitudes on (foreign) NGOs and participation. This study excluded the race demographic because ninety-five percent of the

respondents self-identified as “Black.” Dummy variables were computed for affiliation as Catholic or Protestant, with non-Christians as the comparison category.

Table 3 About Here

Table 3 shows descriptive statistics for the variables used in this study.

Findings

Table 4 About Here

What accounts for variation in respondent attitudes toward the performance of foreign NGOs? In Table 4, I estimate the effects of different demographic variables on the respondent’s relative evaluation of foreign NGOs. Based on these results, when controlling for denomination, urban/rural residence and education, the effect of church attendance on attitudes toward foreign NGOs is statistically significant and negative for both men and women. Religiously observant Haitians have somewhat less positive evaluations of foreign NGOs than do their less religious counterparts. Education has a statistically significant effect on attitude toward Foreign NGOs for women only, and the effect is negative. Less educated women are more likely to view NGOs positively than more educated women.

The main variable that explains variation in the evaluation of foreign NGOs is religiosity, as measured by church attendance, which has a strong, significant, and negative effect for both genders. The effects of church attendance are about twice as strong for men as for women ($B = -.276$ and $-.129$, respectively). Substantively, this means that less religious respondents are more likely to evaluate foreign NGOs positively than respondents who are more religious.

Table 5 About Here

How do attitudes toward foreign NGOs affect participation in public affairs? In Table 5 I estimated the effects of attitudes toward foreign NGOs on civic participation. The model for men

shows that education, rural residence, and positive evaluation of foreign NGOs all have positive effects on participation in public affairs. This shows that positive attitudes toward the performance of foreign NGOs has an independent effect on participation, and is not simply a function of rural residence or education. The same is true for women, except that the effects of rural residence are not significant. The effect of positive foreign NGO evaluation is more than twice as strong for men as for women. In sum, people who evaluate Foreign NGOs positively are most likely to participate than people who evaluate them negatively. This differs from the Dependency theory in which the assumption of the theory would show that people would not participate; instead Foreign NGOs are empowering them here.

Table 6 About Here

The dependent variable in Table 6 measures whether or not the respondent is registered to vote. Again, the independent variables in this analysis are urban/rural residence, education, difference in attitudes toward foreign NGOs , church attendance , and affiliation as Protestant or Catholic. Because the dependent variable is dichotomous, the analysis is based on logistic regression.

The models in Table 6 explain very little variation in voter registration. The effects of evaluations of foreign NGOs on voter registration is marginally significant for men ($p = .073$). Difference in attitudes toward foreign NGOs does not affect the likelihood of women to register to vote. Affiliation as a Catholic has a significant effect on the likelihood that men will register to vote. Catholic men are more likely to register to vote than non-Catholic men, but religion or being Catholic does not significantly affect voter registration among women. The effects of church attendance are statistically significant ($p = .002$) for women to register to vote but denominational affiliation has no effect.

Table 7 About Here

The dependent variable in Table 7 measures whether the respondent actually voted or not. This table's predictor variables are urban/rural residence, education, relative evaluation of Foreign NGOs, church attendance, and affiliation as Protestant, or Catholic. Again, since the dependent variable is binary, the analysis procedure is logistic regression.

The results in Table 7 show that it is very likely the men who are Catholic will vote ($B = .773$, $p = .000$). Women who are educated are most likely to vote ($p = .001$), but the effects of their feeling about foreign NGOs are marginally significant, and negative ($B = -.204$; $p = .085$). This means that women who evaluate foreign NGOs negatively are very slightly more likely to vote than those whose evaluations are more positive.

Thus, these results in Table 5, show that Haitians of both sexes who evaluate foreign NGOs positively are substantially and significantly more likely to engage in civic participation than those who do not. These effects persist in the face of controls for education, religiosity, and religious affiliation. However, the evaluation of foreign NGOs is not related to electoral participation for either men or women, as shown in Tables 6 and 7.

Conclusions

This study poses several interesting questions. First, why are foreign NGOs evaluated more negatively by religiously observant Haitians? It may be possible the religious organizations view foreign NGOs as potential competitors. For example, some religious organizations provide healthcare (and education). Their views on contraception may be different from secular NGOs family planning centers. Haiti's abortion policy is very narrow.⁵ Abortion is only permitted on

⁵ The performance of abortions in Haiti is governed by the provisions of the Haitian Penal Code, which is based on Article 317 of the French Penal Code of 1810. Under the Code, any person performing an abortion is subject to imprisonment, whether the woman consented to the abortion or not. A pregnant woman who performs her own

the ground to save the life of the mother. Abortion cannot be performed on the grounds of available on request, for social and economic reasons or for mental health reasons. Abortion can only be permitted by “official interpretation” on the grounds to preserve physical health, for rape or incest, or for fetal impairment (UN 2014b).

Second, the results reported here suggest that Foreign NGOs may have an encouraging effect on civic participation, such as community organizations, parent/teachers meetings or professional organizations, but not on Haitians’ motivation to vote. This poses a question of why is there a difference between electoral participation and community participation. It could likely be explained that perhaps foreign NGOs are not partisan (non-partisan) and do not encourage people to participate in elections. Further research should investigate methods used for foreign NGOs, and determine whether leaders of such organizations regard their roles as non-partisan. These results support the expectations of liberal institutionalists, who suggest that foreign NGOs collaborate with states in encouraging compliance and legitimacy, and are less interested in enhancing citizen empowerment and representation.

Third, why do the effects of affect toward foreign NGOs seem stronger for men? Perhaps socializing effects of foreign NGOs is inhibited by cultural expectations for women in Haiti’s patriarchal culture.

This current study confirms Schuller’s (2012a) hybrid theory of civic participation (Putnam, 2000) in civil society. Genetically modified collective organizations continue to exist in Haiti, is proof that Haiti’s civil society has adapted to the managerial regimes of NGOs to re-evaluate aid policy. In other words, there is social capital in Haiti even after the earthquake.

abortion or permits an abortion to be performed on her is also subject to imprisonment. If the abortion is performed by a medical professional, the punishment is forced labor (UN, 2014c).

In this study the most important finding is strong effect of affect toward foreign NGOs on civic participation. Foreign NGOs seem empowering, and they encourage, (if non-partisan) citizenship. This is contrary to the dependency theory.

Women may not vote because of the high patriarchal attitude towards women in Haiti.⁶ These results may also indirectly support the feminist theory for international relations: that the gender inequality that exist globally must be addressed. It could also be possible that NGOs are not just non-partisan but not having autonomy. Staff and directors' hands are tied with conditionality, and because donor economic or geopolitical goals are different from the recipients' needs. For example, right-wing or religious donors goals may be pro-life and secular NGOs may be pro-choice. Another theme for future research would be to examine and operationalize the outcome of women participating in the community organizations and electoral activities; and seek if their participation is the result of true democratization or just development, and not sustainable goals?

⁶ “The Representatives of the Ministry for the Status of Women interviewed for the Maternowska (2006) study declared that even poverty in Haiti is gendered. Raised in an environment of neglect, slavery, overwork, sexual abuse, and violence, females are fed less than their male counterparts, forced to work harder, given less schooling and denied equal access to medical care.” Rape is generally perceived as unfortunate event and not a crime. Government policy has failed to implement rape laws, police rape or laws for internal violence and domestic violence. Extra marital affairs are public and women are expected to remain faithful. Women are beaten for refusing sex by the unfaithful men (Maternowska, 2006).

References

- Alnoor, Ebriham, 2003. "Accountability in Practice: Mechanisms for NGOs." *World Development*. Vol. 31, Issue 5. 813-829.
- Black, Richard. 2001. "Fifty Years of Refugee Studies: From Theory to Policy." *International Migration Review*, Vol. 35, No. 1, Special Issue: UNHCR at 50: Past, Present and Future of Refugee Assistance (Spring, 2001), pp. 57-78. Published by: The Center for Migration Studies of New York, Inc.
- CIA. 2014. "Haiti." World Factbook. Central Intelligence Agency.
<https://www.cia.gov/library/publications/the-world-factbook/geos/ha.html>.
Accessed October 8, 2014.
- Elshtain, Jean Bethke. 1987. *Women and War*. New York: Basic Books. 1988
- Enloe, Cynthia H. 1990. *Bananas, Beaches & Bases: Making Feminist Sense of International Politics*. Berkeley : University of California Press.
- Enloe, Cynthia . 2004. "Gender is Not Enough: The Need for a Feminist Consciousness." *International Affairs*. 80.1 (January): 95–97.
- Fatton, Robert. 2014. *Haiti: Trapped in the Outer Periphery*. Boulder, Colorado : Lynne Rienner.
- Grant, Rebecca and Kathleen Newland. 1991. *Gender and International Relations*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.
- Haiti Libre, 2014a "Haiti Politic: Political Participation of Women in National Affairs"
<http://www.haitilibre.com/en/news-4288-haiti-politic-political-participation-of-women-in-national-affairs.html>. Accessed December 1, 2014.
- Haiti Libre. 2014b "Haiti Politic: The Importance of Women in Political Life."
<http://www.haitilibre.com/en/news-10448-haiti-politic-the-importance-of-women-in-political-life.html>. Accessed December 1, 2014.
- Haiti Libre, 2014c. "Haiti Politic: 7 Women Ministers a First in Haiti."
<http://www.haitilibre.com/en/news-5675-haiti-politic-7-women-ministers-a-first-in-haiti.html>. Accessed December 1, 2014.
- Harrell-Bond, Barbara. 1986. *Imposing Aid: Emergency Assistance to Refugees*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- GPO. 2014. Government Printing Office: Public Law 98-67 The Caribbean Basin Economic Recovery Act (CBERA).
<http://www.gpo.gov/fdsys/pkg/STATUTE-97/pdf/STATUTE-97-Pg369.pdf>. Accessed November 7, 2014.

- Harding, Sandra G. 1986. *The Science Question in Feminism*. Ithaca : Cornell University Press.
- IMF. 2014 “Empowering Women Is Smart Economics.” International Monetary Fund. *Finance & Development*, March 2012, Vol. 49, No. 1
<http://www.imf.org/external/pubs/ft/fandd/2012/03/revenga.htm>
 Accessed November 3, 2014.
- Jakobsen, Stine Finne. 2011. “How to behave: Advice from IDPs.” *Forced Migration Review*, March 2011, Issue 37. Oxford: Refugee Studies Centre, Oxford Department of International Development.
- Kristoff and Panarelli. 2014. “Haiti: A Republic of NGO?” United States Institute of Peace. Peace Brief 23. Apr 6, 2010. USIP.org
<http://www.usip.org/sites/default/files/PB%2023%20Haiti%20a%20Republic%20of%20NGOs.pdf>
 Accessed October 23, 2014.
- Mansbridge, Jane 1995. “Does Participation Make Better Citizens?” *The Good Society*, April 1, Vol. 5, No.2. 1-7.
- Maternowska, Catherine M. 2006. *Reproducing Inequities: Poverty and the Politics of Population in Haiti*. New Brunswick, N.J: Rutgers University Press.
- Narnwira, Deo Zihindula. 2002. “International Development and Poverty Reduction: An Exploration of NGOs' Perceptions of Performance”. University of Guelph (Canada), ProQuest, UMI. Dissertations Publishing.
- O'Connor, Amy and Michelle Shumate. 2014. “Differences among NGOs in the Business-NGO Cooperative Network.” *Business and Society*, ISSN 0007-6503, 2014, Volume 53, Issue 1, pp. 105 – 133.
- Ong, Jonathan Corpus. 2015. “Does Humanitarian Aid Mend Community or Break Them?: The Unequal Distribution of Aid following Typhoon Haiyan Has Caused Social Divisions and Feelings of Resentment among Some Filipinos.” Global Development Professional Network. *The Guardian* <http://www.theguardian.com/global-development-professionals-network/2015/mar/27/impact-communities-distribution-aid-typhoon-haiyan-philippines>
 Accessed March 23, 2015.
- Park, Susan and Antje Vetterlein. 2010. *Owning Development : Creating Policy Norms in the IMF and the World Bank*. Cambridge; New York : Cambridge University Press, 2010.
- Parpart, Jane. 1986. *Rethinking Participation, Empowerment, and Development from Gender Perspective*. Ed. By J. Freedman in *Transforming Development: Foreign Aid for a Changing World*. Toronto: University of Toronto press.
- Proudfoot, M. 1957. *European Refugees: 1939-52 - A Study in Forced Population Movement*. London: Faber and Faber.

- Putnam, Robert D. 1995. "Bowling Alone: America's Declining Social Capital." *Journal of Democracy* 6: 65-78.
- Putnam, Robert D. 2000. *Bowling Alone: The Collapse and Revival of American Community*. New York: Simon & Schuster.
- Refstie, H. and C. Brun 2012. "Toward Transformative Participation: Collaborative Research with Urban IDPs' in Uganda. *Journal of Refugee Studies*. Vol. 25 No. 2 239-256.
- Reynell, J. 1986 "Socio-economic Evaluation of the Khmer Camps on the Thai-Kampuchea Border." Report commissioned by the World Food Program, Rome. Oxford: Refugee Studies Program.
- Riley, John M 2002. *Stakeholders in Rural Development: Critical Collaboration in State--NGO Partnerships*. New Delhi; Thousand Oaks, Calif: Sage.
- Schuller, Mark. 2012a. Genetically Modified Organizations?: Understanding & Supporting Civil Society in Urban Haiti." *Journal of Haitian Studies*, Vol. 18, No. 1.50-74.
- Schuller, Mark. 2012b. *Killing with Kindness: Haiti, International Aid, and NGOs*. New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers UP.
- Siyoum, Aschale Dagnachew, Dorothea Hilhorst, Gerrit-Jan Van Uffelen. 2012. "Food Aid and Dependency Syndrome in Ethiopia Local Perceptions." *The Journal of Humanitarian Assistance*. <http://sites.tufts.edu/jha/archives/category/aschale-dagnachew-siyoum> Accessed March 23, 2015.
- Sylvester, Christine. 1994. *Feminist Theory and International Relations in a Postmodern Era* Cambridge [England]; New York : Cambridge University Press.
- Tickner, Ann. 1998. *Gender in International Relations: Feminist Perspectives on Achieving Global Security*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Tickner, J. Ann. 2001. *Gendering World Politics: Issues and Approaches in the Post-Cold War Era*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Tickner, Ann and Laura Sjoberg, 2010. *Feminist International Relations*. London: Routledge.
- UN. 2014b. "United Nations Promotes Gender Equality and Empowering Women." <http://www.unwomen.org/en> Accessed November 18, 2014.
- UN.2014c. United Nations Publication "Haiti Abortion Policy Reproductive Health Context." www.un.org/.../publications/abortion/doc/haiti.doc Accessed October 19, 2014.

Van Praag, Nicholas. 2011. "Aid Agencies Must Listen to the People They're Helping." March 29, 2011. The Guardian. <http://www.theguardian.com/global-development/poverty-matters/2011/mar/29/ashdown-humanitarian-aid-review-listen-beneficiaries> Accessed March 23, 2015.

Verba, Sidney and with Norman H. Nie. 1972. *Participation in America: Political Democracy and Social Equality*. New York: Harper & Row.

Wallerstein, Immanuel M. 1979. *The Capitalist World-Economy: Essays* Cambridge [Eng.] New York: Cambridge University Press.

Wallerstein, Immanuel M. 2004. *World-Systems Analysis: an Introduction* Durham: Duke University Press.

Wallerstein, Immanuel M. 2006. *European Universalism: The Rhetoric of Power* New York : New Press : Distributed by W.W. Norton.

Wilcox, Clyde, Lee Sigelman, and Elizabeth Cook. 1989. "Some Like It Hot: Individual Differences in Responses to Group Feeling Thermometers." *Public Opinion Quarterly* 53.2.

World Bank 2014a. The World Bank's Operational Directive 14.70 for Non-Government Organizations. <http://www.gdrc.org/ngo/wb-ngo-directive.html>. Accessed Oct. 5, 2014.

World Bank 2014b "A Practical Guide to Operational Collaboration between The World Bank and Non-governmental Organizations." http://www-wds.worldbank.org/external/default/WDSContentServer/WDSP/IB/1995/03/01/000009265_3961219103437/Rendered/PDF/multi_page.pdf Accessed Oct. 5, 2014.

World Bank 2014c. "Executive Summary of the Assessment of the Strategic Compact." March 13, 2001. http://www-wds.worldbank.org/external/default/WDSContentServer/WDSP/IB/2003/09/04/000012009_20030904134425/Rendered/PDF/265180Scode0901of0Strategic0Compact.pdf Accessed Oct. 5, 2014.

World Bank, 2014d. "Documents and Reports: Strategic Compact Assessment." <http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/2001/03/2501287/assessment-strategic-compact> Accessed Oct. 5, 2014.

Table 1
Factor analysis of Evaluation of Government Services

National Government. How would you evaluate its performance?	.578
Foreign Governments. How would you evaluate their performance?	.760
Local NGOs. How would you evaluate their performance?	.727
Local Churches. How would you evaluate their performance?	.711
Neighborhood or Community Organizations. How would you evaluate their performance?	.699
Foreign NGOs. How would you evaluate their performance?	.741
Eigenvalue	2.894

List of response categories: In the last year, for each organization, please tell me whether the performance was: 1) Very bad, 2) Bad, 3) Neither good nor bad, 4) Good, 5) Very good.

Source: Computed by author from Latin American Public Opinion Survey, 2012.

Table 2
Factor Analysis of Frequency of attending Meetings

Meetings of any religious organization? Do you attend them...	-.149	.906
Meetings of a community improvement committee or association? Do you attend them...	.746	-.170
Meetings of a parents' association at school? Do you attend them...	.594	.469
Meetings of an association of professionals, merchants manufacturers or farmers? Do you attend them...	.557	-.053
Meetings of a political party or political organization? Do you attend them...	.702	.037
Eigenvalue:	1.736	1.073

List of response categories: I am going to read you a list of groups and organizations. Please tell me if you attend meetings of these organizations: 1) Once a week, 2) Once or twice a month, 3) Once or twice a year, 4) Never.

Source: Computed by author from Latin American Public Opinion Survey, 2012. Varimax rotation.

Table 3
Descriptive Statistics of Variables

	N	Minimum	Maximum	Mean	Std. Deviation
Urban/Rural	1752	1	2	1.61	.488
Sex	1752	1	2	1.50	.500
Education	1686	.00	18.00	9.3720	3.51600
Participation	1747	-4.00	-1.00	-3.3258	.57209
Registered to Vote	1746	.00	1.00	.7233	.44751
Voted	1743	.00	1.00	.5927	.49148
Church Attendance	1752	.00	1.00	.7300	.44410
Protestant	1752	.00	1.00	.3383	.47325
Catholic	1752	.00	1.00	.5202	.49973
Valid N (listwise)	1639				

Source: Computed by author from Latin American Public Opinion Survey, 2012.

Table 4
Multivariate Models of Attitudes toward Foreign NGOs (OLS) by Gender

Unstandardized Coefficients				Unstandardized Coefficients			
Male	B	t	Sig.	Female	B	t	Sig.
(Constant)	.748***	6.133	.000***	(Constant)	.902	6.713	.000***
Catholic	-.003	-.040	.968	Catholic	-.005	-.062	.950
Protestant	.046	.635	.526	Protestant	-.058	-.730	.466
Church Attendance	-.276***	-5.121	.000**	Church Attendance	-.129*	-2.355	.019
Education	.002*	.338	.735	Education	-.015*	-2.184	.029
Urban/Rural	-.070	-1.500	.134	Urban/Rural	-.053	-1.139	.255
R Square	.040			R Square	.018		

Dependent Variable: Evaluation of Foreign NGOs

N = 844 males; N= 808 females

*significant at .05

**significant at .01

***significant at .001

Source: Computed by author from Latin American Public Opinion Survey, 2012.

Table 5
Multivariate Models of Civic (or Communal) Participation (OLS)

Unstandardized Coefficients				Unstandardized Coefficients			
Male	B	t	Sig.	Female	B	t	Sig.
(Constant)	-3.309***	-30.931	.000***	(Constant)	--364***	-26.815	.000***
Catholic	.044	.783	.434	Catholic	-.090	-1.331	.184
Protestant	-.067	-1.080	.281	Protestant	-.126@	-1.748	.081
Attend	.023	.484	.628	Attend	.069	1.387	.166
Education	.004*	.796	.426	Education	.004*	.577	.564
Urban/Rural	-.098*	-2.447	.015	Urban/Rural	-.025	-.583	.560
Evaluation of Foreign NGOs	.310***	10.486	.000***	Evaluation of Foreign NGOs	.119***	3.708	.000***
R Square	.137			R Square	.023		

Dependent Variable: Participation in Organizations

N = 843 males; N= 806 females

@ significant at .10

*significant at .05

**significant at .01

***significant at .001

Source: Computed by author from Latin American Public Opinion Survey, 2012.

Table 6
Multivariate Model of Vote Registration (Logistic Regression)

Male	B	Sig	Female	B	Sig
Urban/Rural	-.171	.308	Urban/Rural	.232	.188
Education	.014	.520	Education	.076	.003***
Evaluation of Foreign NGOs	.219@	.073@	Evaluation of Foreign NGOs	-.092	.488
Church Attendance	.234	.229	Church Attendance	.622**	.002***
Prot	.370	.128	Prot	-.388	.206
Catholic	.865***	.000***	Catholic	-.268	.351
Constant	.242	.578	Constant	-.144	.777
Nagelkerke R ²	.050		Nagelkerke R ²	.038	

Dependent Variable: Registered to Vote or not Registered to Vote

N = 876 males; N= 876 females

@ significant at .10

*significant at .05

**significant at .01

***significant at .001

Source: Computed by author from Latin American Public Opinion Survey, 2012.

Table 7
Multivariate Model of Electoral Participation (Logistic Regression)

Male	B	Sig	Female	B	Sig
Urban/Rural	-.197	.202	Urban/Rural	.083	.599
Education	.057**	.006**	Education	.076***	.001***
Evaluation of Foreign NGOs	.075	.512	Evaluation of Foreign NGOs	-.204@	.085@
Church Attendance	-.076	.678	Church Attendance	.290	.114
Prot	.336	.152	Prot	-.345	.208
Catholic	.773***	.000***	Catholic	-.390	.129
Constant	-.322	.433	Constant	-.240	.606
Nagelkerke R ²	.049		Nagelkerke R ²	.034	

Dependent Variable: Voted or not Voted

N = 842 males; N= 809 females [Total males was 876 and total females is 876]

@ significant at .10

*significant at .05

**significant at .01

***significant at .001

Source: Computed by author from Latin American Public Opinion Survey, 2012.